

Corn Oil Tally Sheet of Quality Ratings - Effect on Blood Lipids, Design Type 3 Studies

Instructions: This sheet can be used to record quality rating for each criterion (Yes/No/NA) and the final quality determination (+,Ø,-) as each article is appraised. Recording answers for each criterion provides a record for future reference and facilitates a check of intra- and interrater reliability. Rows across the bottom can be used for notes. In this example the space is used to note specific information that would be relevant to the Expert Group responsible for formulating the Conclusion Statement and its grade.

	Non-RT	Non-RT	Non-RT	Non-RT	Non-RT	Non-RT	Non-RT
Author	Cuchel et al.	Imaki et al.	Mitchell et al.	Zanni et al.	Snook et al.	Fisher et al.	Chance et al.
Year	1996	1989	1989	1987	1985	1983	1969
Relevance Questions							
1	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
2	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
3	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Validity Questions							
1	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
2	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
3	NA	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	No
4	No	NA	No	No	Yes	NA	Yes
5	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	No	No
6	Yes	Yes-weak c	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
7	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
8	Yes	Yes-weak	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No
9	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
10	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Quality Rating (+, Ø, -)	+	+	NA	+	+	+	-
Magnitude of Effect	$P<0.05$	$P<0.05$	$P<0.001$	$P<0.05$	$P<0.05$	$P<0.05$	$P<0.05$
Sample Size	14	4	6	9	12	9	34
Relevance to Target Population	Hyperchol-esterolemic	Healthy men	Healthy men	Healthy women	Healthy men and women	Healthy men	Diabetic children

Corn Oil Tally Sheet of Quality Ratings - Effect on Blood Lipids, Design Type 3 Studies

Instructions: This sheet can be used to record quality rating for each criterion (Yes/No/NA) and the final quality determination (+,Ø,-) as each article is appraised. Recording answers for each criterion provides a record for future reference and facilitates a check of intra- and interrater reliability. Rows across the bottom can be used for notes. In this example the space is used to note specific information that would be relevant to the Expert Group responsible for formulating the Conclusion Statement and its grade.

	Non-RT	Non-RT	Non-RT	Non-RT	Non-RT	Non-RT	Non-RT
Author	Kaplan et al.	Haust & Beveridge	Watson	Lloyd et al.	Kingsbury et al.	Horlick	Rhoads and Barker
Year	1965	1963	1963	1962	1961	1959	1959
Relevance Questions							
1	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
2	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
3	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Validity Questions							
1	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
2	Yes-weak	No	Yes	No	Yes-weak	No	Yes
3	NA	No	No	No	Yes-weak	No	NA
4	NA	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	Yes
5	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	No	Yes
7	Yes-weak	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes
8	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
9	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
10	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Quality Rating (+, Ø, -)	Ø	-	Ø	Ø/-	Ø	-	Ø
Magnitude of Effect	Not specified	Not specified	$P < 0.001$	$P < 0.05$	Not specified	Not specified	Not specified
Sample Size	8	2	28	31	11	6?	8
Relevance to Target Population	Peptic ulcer pts	Healthy and diabetic men	Men with MI	Diabetic children	Healthy	Healthy	Hypercholesterolemic

Corn Oil Tally Sheet of Quality Ratings - Effect on Blood Lipids, Design Type 3 Studies

Instructions: This sheet can be used to record quality rating for each criterion (Yes/No/NA) and the final quality determination (+,Ø,-) as each article is appraised. Recording answers for each criterion provides a record for future reference and facilitates a check of intra- and interrater reliability. Rows across the bottom can be used for notes. In this example the space is used to note specific information that would be relevant to the Expert Group responsible for formulating the Conclusion Statement and its grade.

	Non-RT	Non-RT	Non-RT				
Author	Grande et al.	Tobian and Tuna	Engelberg				
Year	1958	1958	1957				
Relevance Questions							
1	Yes	Yes	No				
2	No	Yes	Yes				
3	Yes	Yes	Yes				
4	Yes	Yes	Yes				
Validity Questions							
1	Yes	Yes	Yes				
2	Yes	No	Yes				
3	No	NA	No				
4	No	No	Yes				
5	No	No	No				
6	No	No	No				
7	Yes	No	No				
8	No	No	No				
9	Yes	Yes	No				
10	Yes	Yes	No				
Quality Rating (+, Ø, -)	Ø	-	-				
Magnitude of Effect	Not specified	Not specified	Not specified				
Sample Size	93	23	12				
Relevance to Target Population	Schizophrenic men	Men with CVD	Private pts				