

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
BEFORE THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEALS BOARD
CIVIL REMEDIES DIVISION
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES

In the Case of:)
)
Center for Tobacco Products,)
)
Complainant,)
)
v.)
)
Saturnino Nunez)
d/b/a Jay-Nez Grocery,)
)
Respondent.)

**ADMINISTRATIVE COMPLAINT
FOR CIVIL MONEY PENALTIES**

FDA Docket No. FDA-2014-H-0153
CRD Docket No. C-14-613

INTRODUCTION

1. The Center for Tobacco Products (CTP), Food and Drug Administration (FDA), United States Department of Health and Human Services, seeks a civil money penalty (CMP) in the amount of \$5,000 from Saturnino Nunez d/b/a Jay-Nez Grocery (Respondent) for violating the Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act (Act). Most recently during a two-part inspection of the establishment conducted on August 26 and 27, 2013, FDA-commissioned inspectors documented a violation for selling individual cigarettes, in violation of 21 C.F.R. § 1140.14(d). Details regarding the case history are included in Paragraphs 8 – 10 below.
2. Respondent owns an establishment that sells tobacco products, which does business under the name Jay-Nez Grocery, located at 227 Ferry Street, New Haven, CT 06513.

LEGAL AUTHORITY

3. FDA has the authority to seek civil money penalties from any person who violates a requirement of the Act related to tobacco products. 21 U.S.C. § 333(f)(9).
4. The Act prohibits the misbranding of a tobacco product while such product is held for sale after shipment of the product or its components in interstate commerce. 21 U.S.C. § 331(k).
5. A tobacco product is deemed to be misbranded if it is sold or distributed in violation of regulations issued under Section 906(d) of the Act (21 U.S.C. § 387f(d)). 21 U.S.C. § 387c(a)(7)(B); 21 C.F.R. § 1140.1(b).
6. The regulations at 21 C.F.R. Part 1140 were issued under Section 906(d) of the Act (21 U.S.C. § 387f(d)). Therefore, selling or distributing a tobacco product in violation of these regulations causes that tobacco product to be misbranded.
7. FDA has documented multiple violations of 21 C.F.R. Part 1140 at Respondent's establishment, as detailed below.

CASE HISTORY

8. FDA-commissioned inspectors documented violations during three inspections at Respondent's establishment within a thirty six month period.
9. Previously, on June 7, 2013, CTP initiated a civil money penalty action, FDA Docket Number FDA-2013-H-0669, CRD Docket Number C-13-859, against Saturnino Nunez d/b/a Jay-Nez Grocery for four violations of 21 C.F.R. Part 1140 within a twenty-four month period. See FDA Docket Number FDA-2013-H-0669, CRD Docket Number C-13-859, Complaint, ¶ 13. The earlier Complaint alleged that Saturnino Nunez d/b/a Jay-Nez Grocery violated 21 C.F.R. § 1140.14(a),

§ 1140.14(b)(1) and § 1140.14(d) on January 9, 2013 by selling tobacco products to a minor, failing to verify photographic identification and selling individual cigarettes. *Id* at ¶ 1. The earlier Complaint also alleged that CTP issued a Warning letter to Jay-Nez Grocery on August 30, 2012, citing a violation on June 26, 2012, and stating that failure to correct the violations may result in a civil money penalty action, or other regulatory action by FDA. *Id.* at ¶ 10.

10. The action described in Paragraph 9 was settled by the parties. Saturnino Nunez identified himself as being authorized to settle claims on behalf of Saturnino Nunez d/b/a Jay-Nez Grocery and signed two Acknowledgment Forms, one dated June 10, 2013, and the second dated July 26, 2013, admitting that the violations described in the Complaint filed in FDA Docket Number FDA-2013-H-0669, CRD Docket Number C-13-859 occurred, waiving his/her ability to contest the violations in the future, and stating that he/she understood that the violations may be counted in determining the total number of violations for purposes of future enforcement actions. See Acknowledgment Form, FDA Docket Number FDA-2013-H-0669, CRD Docket Number C-13-859. The court closed the earlier action on August 8, 2013.

PROPOSED PENALTY

11. Retailers who have violated regulations promulgated under Section 906(d) of the Act (21 U.S.C. § 387f(d)) may incur a civil money penalty up to the amounts provided in the following table:

Number of Violations	Civil Money Penalty
1	\$0.00 w/ warning letter
2 within a 12 month period	\$250
3 within a 24 month period	\$500
4 within a 24 month period	\$2,000
5 within a 36 month period	\$5,000
6 within a 48 month period	\$10,000

See 21 C.F.R. § 17.2; *Guidance for FDA and Tobacco Retailers, Civil Money Penalties and No-Tobacco-Sale Orders for Tobacco Retailers*, September 2013 (available at

<http://www.fda.gov/downloads/TobaccoProducts/GuidanceComplianceRegulatoryInformation/UCM252955.pdf>).

12. CTP requests that a civil money penalty in the amount of \$5,000 be assessed against Respondent for five violations of 21 C.F.R. Part 1140 within a thirty-six month period.

OPTIONS FOR RESPONDING TO COMPLAINT

13. Respondent must take one of the following four actions within the time listed below:
 - a. Acknowledge that the violations occurred and pay the penalty: To pay the penalty, Respondent should follow the instructions detailed in the cover letter.

Respondent should not send any payments to CTP before submitting the Acknowledgment Form, which must be submitted within 15 days after service of the Complaint. Payment must be received by CTP within 30 days after service of the Complaint or Respondent must either file an Answer to the Complaint (see option (c) below) or request an extension of time for filing the Answer (see option (d) below).

- b. Request Settlement: Respondent may choose to participate in discussions with CTP to reach a settlement of this matter. If after a Settlement Conference, Respondent submits an acknowledgment of the violations and pays an agreed-upon penalty amount, a hearing would no longer be necessary. Payment must be received by CTP within 30 days after service of the Complaint or Respondent must either file an Answer to the Complaint (see option (c) below) or request an extension of time for filing the Answer (see option (d) below).
- c. File an Answer: Respondent has the right to request a hearing by filing an Answer within 30 days after service of the Complaint. The Answer shall be deemed to be a request for a hearing, unless the Answer states otherwise. The failure to file an Answer within 30 days after service of the Complaint may result in the imposition of the proposed civil money penalty. 21 C.F.R. § 17.11. Instructions for filing an Answer are listed in Paragraph 16.
- d. Request an Extension: Respondent has the right to request an extension of time to file an Answer, for good cause. This request must be made within 30

days after service of the Complaint. Instructions for filing for an extension are listed in Paragraphs 19 and 20.

14. Respondent has the right, but is not required, to retain counsel for representation.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR FILING AN ANSWER TO REQUEST A HEARING

15. Rules for drafting and filing the Answer can be found at 21 C.F.R. § 17.9.
16. If filing an Answer, the Answer:
 - a. Must be filed with the Departmental Appeals Board, Civil Remedies Division, 330 Independence Ave., S.W., Cohen Building, Room G-644 (MS 6132), ATTN: FDA CMP, Washington, D.C. 20201. The Answer must include both the FDA Docket Number and CRD Docket Number which are found at the top of this document.
 - b. Must include the following:
 - i. Admission or denial of each of the allegations of liability found in this Complaint, including specifically the allegations in Paragraphs 1-2 and 9-10. Allegations not specifically denied in the Answer will be considered admitted;
 - ii. All defenses on which Respondent intends to rely;
 - iii. All reasons (if any) why Respondent contends that the penalty should be less than the amount stated in Paragraph 12. Examples include: any retailer training program Respondent has put in place, any state penalty Respondent paid for this alleged violation, or reasons Respondent is unable to pay the penalty; and

- iv. The name, address, and telephone number of Respondent's counsel (if any). Other contact information, such as e-mail address, may be included.
 - c. May also include the following:
 - i. Information (if any) regarding penalties paid to a State for the same violation(s) charged in this Complaint. FDA will consider this information for purposes of determining a civil money penalty. *Guidance for FDA and Tobacco Retailers, Civil Money Penalties and No-Tobacco-Sale Orders for Tobacco Retailers, September 2013.*
 - ii. A request for an informal Settlement Conference to discuss reducing the penalty amount owed. Such a request may be filed as a part of the Answer, and is not an alternative to filing a complete Answer. If an informal Settlement Conference results in an agreed payment of a reduced penalty and written acknowledgment by Respondent that the violations occurred, a hearing would no longer be necessary.
- 17. If, after the Answer is filed, Respondent needs to change the Answer, Respondent can do so by filing a motion with the Departmental Appeals Board, Civil Remedies Division, 330 Independence Ave., S.W., Cohen Building, Room G-644 (MS 6132), ATTN: FDA CMP, Washington, D.C. 20201. 21 C.F.R. § 17.9(d). The motion must include both the FDA Docket Number and CRD Docket Number which can be found at the top of this document.

18. The failure to file an Answer or make full payment within 30 days after service of the Complaint may result in the imposition of the proposed civil money penalty.
21 C.F.R. § 17.11.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR FILING A REQUEST FOR AN EXTENSION

19. Within 30 days after service of the Complaint, Respondent may request an extension of time to file an Answer. 21 C.F.R. § 17.9(c).
20. The request for an extension should be filed with the Departmental Appeals Board, Civil Remedies Division, 330 Independence Ave., S.W., Cohen Building, Room G-644 (MS 6132), ATTN: FDA CMP, Washington, D.C. 20201. The request must include both the FDA Docket Number and CRD Docket Number.
21. The Administrative Law Judge may grant Respondent up to 30 additional days to file an Answer, if good cause is shown. 21 C.F.R. § 17.9(c).

REQUEST FOR RELIEF

22. CTP respectfully requests that an order assessing a civil money penalty against Respondent in the amount of \$5,000 be entered.

DATED: February 10, 2014

Respectfully submitted,

/s/

Julie Dohm

Attorney for Complainant
Center for Tobacco Products
United States Food and Drug
Administration
White Oak 31, Room 4582
10903 New Hampshire Avenue
Silver Spring, MD 20993-0002
Telephone: (301) 796-8732
Fax: (301) 847-8638
Email: julie.dohm@fda.hhs.gov